



METROPOLITAN  
TRANSPORTATION  
COMMISSION

Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter  
101 Eighth Street  
Oakland, CA 94607-4700  
TEL 510.817.5700  
TTY/TDD 510.817.5769  
FAX 510.817.5848  
E-MAIL [info@mtc.ca.gov](mailto:info@mtc.ca.gov)  
WEB [www.mtc.ca.gov](http://www.mtc.ca.gov)

**Bill Dodd, Chair**  
Napa County and Cities

**Scott Haggerty, Vice Chair**  
Alameda County

**Tom Ammiano**  
City and County of San Francisco

**Tom Azumbrado**  
U.S. Department of Housing  
and Urban Development

**Tom Bates**  
Cities of Alameda County

**Bob Blanchard**  
Sonoma County and Cities

**Dean J. Chu**  
Cities of Santa Clara County

**Dave Cortese**  
Association of Bay Area Governments

**Dorene M. Giacopini**  
U.S. Department of Transportation

**Federal D. Glover**  
Contra Costa County

**Anne W. Halsted**  
San Francisco Bay Conservation  
and Development Commission

**Steve Kinsey**  
Marin County and Cities

**Sue Lempert**  
Cities of San Mateo County

**Jon Rubin**  
San Francisco Mayor's Appointee

**Bijan Sartipi**  
State Business, Transportation  
and Housing Agency

**James P. Sperling**  
Solano County and Cities

**Adrienne J. Tissier**  
San Mateo County

**Amy Worth**  
Cities of Contra Costa County

**Ken Yeager**  
Santa Clara County

**Steve Heminger**  
Executive Director

**Ann Flemer**  
Deputy Executive Director, Operations

**Andrew B. Fremier**  
Deputy Executive Director,  
Bay Area Toll Authority

**Therese W. McMillan**  
Deputy Executive Director, Policy

**PLANNING COMMITTEE  
MEETING OF JUNE 8, 2007  
MINUTES**

**ATTENDANCE**

Commissioner Sperling called the Planning Committee meeting to order at 9:30 a.m. Other members in attendance were Commissioners Azumbrado, Chu, Dodd, Haggerty, Lempert, Rubin, Worth, Yeager, and Tissier.

**MINUTES**

The minutes of May 11, 2007 were approved unanimously.

**TRANSPORTATION 2035 PLAN: a) Proposed Principles & Goals; b) Vision & Scenario Performance Assessment; c) Regional Transportation Summit**

Ms. Ashley Nguyen commented on the proposed principles and goals of the Transportation 2035 Plan. She noted that staff did a complete overhaul of the goals for Transportation 2030 in response to criticism that the previous RTP goals were too broad to provide meaningful direction for the plan.

The six goals that were adopted in the Transportation 2030 Plan are: safety, reliability, efficient freight, clean air, access to mobility and livable communities.

Staff requests the Transportation 2035 include two new goals in response to changing environmental issues and new SAFETEA planning regulations: Security and Climate Change.

Ms. Nguyen stated that bring these goals into focus, staff proposed to provide a framework for the goals that is centered on the three principles of Economy, Environment, and Equity (the Three Es). Three Es provide the foundation for the Business, Housing & Transportation Agency's funding of smart growth, blueprint planning efforts around the state, which includes the FOCUS effort being led by ABAG.

Under each of the Three Es, staff has arrayed the eight goals proposed for Transportation 2035. For a prosperous economy, the goals are safety, security, reliability and freight. For a quality environment, the goals are clean air and climate change, and for social equity, the access to mobility and livable communities goals help to advance equitable opportunities and benefits for all Bay Area residents.

Ms. Lisa Klein commented on the Vision & Scenario Performance Assessment, which will highlight how investments to expand the system, along with land use and pricing-based policy initiatives, help achieve specific performance targets tied to the Three Es.



The proposed targets, most of which also happen to reflect state plans of legislation, correspond with each of the three E's: 1) the target under Economy addresses congestion, 2) those under Environment addresses vehicle emissions and VMT, and 3) the target under Equity has yet to be defined.

MTC staff propose to analyze three investment scenarios: 1) Freeway investment, 2) HOT Lanes/Bus, and 3) Rail and Ferry to see how close they get to the targets. She noted that infrastructure investments, which address supply only, wouldn't be enough to reach the targets. For each scenario, staff will test policies that influence travel demand through either land use or pricing to see how effectively they move toward the targets.

In conclusion, Ms. Nguyen outlined the outreach activities for June 2007, which includes a kitchen cabinet meeting on June 13 between MTC commissioners and key stakeholders, a joint meeting of the MTC advisors on June 19, and a regional workshop planned for late June. She noted that staff plans to conduct the scenario performance evaluation in August, and present the evaluation results for a regional summit planned for late October.

Commissioner Azumbrado commented on the reduced carbon dioxide by 40% below 1990 levels, and asked staff what that is compared to today's levels. Mr. Steve Heminger stated that it is roughly a 30% reduction. He also asked how the congestion reduction target was determined. Ms. Klein stated that 20% is a target that is set forth in the Governor's Strategic Growth Plan.

Commissioner Tissier stated that she has suggestions to be included in the goals, and will submit them to in writing to staff.

Commissioner Chu asked how much input staff has had with the Congestion Management Agencies (CMAs)? Ms. Klein stated that staff has been in regular contact with the CMAs, and have put out these targets for their discussion as well. Staff will be meeting again with them on June 18 and June 29 along with the transit operators through the Partnership Technical Advisory Committee and the Partnership Board. She also noted that in terms of putting together the three investment scenarios, staff would be talking with both transit operators and the CMAs in defining the freeway investment scenario and bus scenario.

Commissioner Worth asked if there would be an opportunity for this document to be circulated to the CMAs and then come back to the committee for the final ratification before the goals are set. Ms. Nguyen stated that there is a Partnership Technical Advisory Committee meeting scheduled for June 18<sup>th</sup>, where the goals will be circulated. Staff will be asking the CMAs, as well as the transit operators, to provide comments. Mr. Heminger clarified that the Commission's approval of the goals, set for July, should be reviewed as an initial recommendation that sets parameters for further discussion. As we receive further input including that of locally elected officials during the public outreach process, the Commission has the prerogative to revisit the goals.

Commissioner Haggerty asked if bicycle and pedestrian facilities are included in the scenarios. Mr. Heminger stated that staff is trying to illustrate three large infrastructure alternatives that

might have an impact on the regional transportation system. Bicycle and pedestrian facilities are more locally focused, but will be discussed in more detail as we focus on other plan elements during development of the over plan vision and financially constrained element.

Commissioner Lempert stated that there needs to be a way, possibly through ABAG, to circulate this to all the City Councils, Board of Supervisors, and the region.

Commissioner Sperling commented that he agreed with defining the vision first, and one of the advantages of that it represents a no-constrained approach, which gives staff an opportunity to test and look at opportunities that generally don't get included in the RTP. He also has several comments on the goals, which he submitted to staff in writing.

Commissioner Tissier commented that there should be a way to address important community goals, such as older driver safety.

Commissioner Sperling called for public comment. Mr. David Schonbrunn, TRANSDEF, commented on the relationship between MTC and CMAs. He stated that staff needs to encourage the CMAs to think about their role in reducing VMT. He also commented on the goals, and stated that in terms of the key measures of progress, the reduction in VMT and the greenhouse gas emission levels are not actually reflected – what is included is a reference to the Air Quality District's greenhouse gas inventory. He stated that there is a need, as a goal, to reduce greenhouse gas emissions. He also stated that the reference to the urban core was too narrowly defined. Mr. Duane De Witt stated that staff needs to include the public in the planning process earlier.

Mr. Doug Kimsey commented on the Regional Transportation Summit, and proposed the idea, initiated by Chair Dodd, of combining MTC's Regional Transportation Summit with ABAG's General Assembly; tentative date of October 26<sup>th</sup> or 27<sup>th</sup> has been chosen, with the place to be determined. The Committee concurred with staff's request to combine the RTP Summit and ABAG's General Assembly. Mr. Kimsey noted that staff will come back to this committee in September with the layout of this combined effort.

Mr. Stuart Cohen, TALC, expressed his support of this approach, and stated that the outreach from staff to the coalition has been very strong. He noted that TALC wants staff to not just look at the RTP costs, but also look at the overall transportation costs for users under all the different scenarios.

### **CLIMATE CHANGE ACTIVITIES**

As the newest member of the Joint Policy Committee (JPC), Mr. Will Travis, Executive Director of BCDC observed that the Committee has developed an intensive program to study the issue of climate change and will recommend an initial set of actions to be pursued jointly by the four regional agencies: ABAG, BAAQMD, BCDC, and MTC, which is scheduled to conclude in September 2007.

Mr. Travis then, presented a PowerPoint presentation illustrating the impact of the rise in water levels along the shoreline of San Francisco Bay – including significant potential consequences for the region's transportation infrastructure.

Commissioner Lempert asked if there is a list of the 26 cities that face the bay so that more attention can be focused on their land use policies. Mr. Travis responded that they do have a list, and noted that the 26 cities encompass the nine Bay Area counties.

Commissioner Spering thanked Mr. Travis, and observed that climate change is a project that must be addressed globally.

**OTHER BUSINESS/PUBLIC COMMENT**

There being no other business, the meeting adjourned at 10:58 a.m. The Committee's next meeting is scheduled for Friday, July 13, 2007 at 9:30 a.m. in the Lawrence D. Dahms Auditorium, Joseph P. Bort MetroCenter, Oakland, CA.